

END PROGRAMME EVALUATION



Prepared by
Romina Dewan Kabir
Programme Evaluator

End-of-Programme Evaluation

**Bangladesh Water Integrity Network (BAWIN)
Transparency International Bangladesh (TI-B)**

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	6
List of Abbreviations	7
Executive Summary	8
BAWIN Composition and Support	8
Vision	8
Evaluation	9
Evaluator’s Tasks.....	9
Methodology	9
Overall Findings	10
Achievement of Objectives	11
Conclusion	11
Introduction.....	13
Background	13
Water Integrity Network and TI-B.....	14
Bangladesh Water Integrity Network	14
Vision of BAWIN	15
Objectives of BAWIN	15
BAWIN Organisational/Corporate Members	15
Roles, Responsibilities, and Reporting Lines	15
BAWIN	15
WIN	16
TI-B	16
EVALUATION Objectives, STRUCTURE, METHODOLOGY, AND LIMITATIONS	17
Specific Objectives	17
Objective 1: Evaluate Effectiveness of the Programme Structure.....	17
Objective 2: Evaluate the Implementation of Programme Activities	17
Evaluator’s Tasks	18
Methodology and Approach.....	18
Limitations of the Review.....	19
Findings: DOCUMENT REVIEW ON ToOLS, Research, and Advocacy activities	20
Strengths Identified.....	20
BAWIN	20
KWASA	20
Gaps Identified	21
BAWIN	21
KWASA	21
Findings: Semi-Structured Interviews	22
Strengths Identified.....	22
BAWIN	22
KWASA	22
Gaps Identified	22
BAWIN	22
KWASA	23
Findings: Key Informant Interviews	24
Findings: SWOT and Force Field Analysis	25
Strengths	25
Weaknesses	25
Opportunities	26
Threats.....	26
Findings: Field Visit	27
Strengths and Gaps Identified	27
BAWIN	27
KWASA	27
Consultant Observations.....	29
Strengths Identified: BAWIN.....	29

Human Resources, Management, and Network Support	29
Advocacy and Research	29
Training and Capacity Building	30
Local-Level Support	30
Strengths Identified: KWASA	30
Gaps Identified: BAWIN.....	31
Human Resources, Management, and Network Support	31
Advocacy, Research, and Fundraising	31
Training and Capacity Building	32
Monitoring and Evaluation	32
Local-Level Support	32
Gaps Identified: KWASA	33
Conclusions	33
Impact and effectiveness of the Programme	34
Achievements in relation to Vision and Objectives	35
Vision	35
Objectives	35
Specific strategic direction for future programming.....	37
Human Resources, Management, and Network Members	37
Recommendations: BAWIN and KWASA	37
Training and Capacity Building.....	37
Recommendations: BAWIN	37
Recommendations: KWASA	38
Research, Knowledge, Communications, Advocacy, and Publications	38
Recommendations: BAWIN	38
Recommendations: KWASA	39
Monitoring	39
Recommendations: BAWIN and KWASA	39
Conclusion.....	41

Annexure

Annex	-1	Work plan
Annex	-2	Semi Structured Interview Names of the People Interviewed
Annex	-3	Key Informant Interview Names of the People Interviewed
Annex	-4	Field visit Names of the Participants
Annex	- 5	List of the document reviewed
Annex	- 6	Status of Activities
Annex	-7	News Paper Clippings
Annex	-8	Questionnaire
Annex	- 9	Extract of Meeting Minutes

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Every collaborative project, large or small, owes its success largely to the effort of many devoted individuals. I sincerely appreciate the inspiration, support, and guidance of everyone who has been instrumental in making this End-of-Programme Evaluation a success.

Thanks go to all team members at international, national, and local levels who supported the work involved in the evaluation process. Particular mention must go to the following people for their time, patience, advice, input, and logistical support.

First, thank you to the various network members who gave their valuable time and shared their suggestions to enrich the findings of the evaluation.

Thanks go to the members of Concerned Citizen Committees, Youth Engagement and Support, and Khulna journalists for their input and support. The Assistant Manager of the Khulna office of Transparency International Bangladesh (TI-B) deserves special thanks for making the field visit a success upon short notice.

The Managing Director of KWASA, as well as the Khulna University professor who served as an Integrity Management Coach in the use of the IM Toolbox, also deserve thanks for sharing their valuable opinions on KWASA.

Heartfelt thanks go to the Project Officer of BAWIN, for continuous support and for making critical resources available as and when needed. Without her contributions, the smooth course of the evaluation would not have been possible.

Sincere thanks go to the Director, Outreach and Communication, TI-B for his strong support, especially at the outset of the evaluation, which enabled an efficient start.

Special thanks also go to the Programme Coordinator, South Asia, WIN for his valuable information and documents, which made the successful completion of the evaluation possible.

I am extremely grateful to the Deputy Executive Director, TI-B, for her critical advice and direction, which were invaluable in enriching evaluation findings.

I would like to convey my special gratitude to the Executive Director, TI-B, for his technical knowledge, which added great value to the findings.

Lastly, I am extremely grateful to TI-B for entrusting me with responsibility for carrying out this End-of-Programme Evaluation of BAWIN.

It is my hope that this report will help TI-B to take recommended steps to continue the programme and work effectively towards its vision and objectives on water integrity in Bangladesh.

Romina Dewan Kabir
Programme Evaluator

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BAWIN	Bangladesh Water Integrity Network
BIBEC	Building Integrity Blocks for Effective Change
BRAC	Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
BTV	Bangladesh Television
BWDB	Bangladesh Water Development Board
CCC	Committee of Concern Citizens
CPI	Corruption Perceptions Index
CFG	Climate Finance Governance
CWASA	Chittagong Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
DGIS	Directorates-General for International Cooperation
ETP	effluent treatment plant
DWASA	Dhaka Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
IEC	Information Education and Communication
INGO	international non-governmental organisation
IM	Integrity Management
IMC	Integrity Management Coach
KDA	Khulna Development Authority
KII	key informant interview
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
KWASA	Khulna Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
LDC	least-developed country
LGIs	Local Government Institution
MD	Managing Director
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
NGO	non-governmental organisation
PC	Project Coordinator
PO	Project Officer
PPP	public-private partnership
PPPP	people-public-private partnership
RTI	Right to Information
SDG	sustainable development goal
SMART	specific, measurable, attainable, realistic, and time-bound
SWOT	strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats
TI	Transparency International
TI-B	Transparency International Berlin
WIN	Water Integrity Network
YES	Youth Engagement and Support

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Water is central to the way of life in Bangladesh and the single-most important resource for the well-being of its people. It sustains an extremely fragile natural environment and provides a livelihood for millions of people. As water is essential for human survival, socio-economic development of the country, and preservation of its natural environment, it is the policy of the Government of Bangladesh that all necessary means and measures be taken to manage the water resources of the country in a comprehensive, integrated, and equitable manner.

The policies are designed to ensure continued progress towards fulfilling the national goals of economic development, poverty alleviation, food security, public health and safety, decent standard of living, and protection of the natural environment.

The National Water Policy 1999 recognizes Bangladesh as a water-dependent country which suffers from a somewhat-chaotic context at its management institutions, and seeks to remedy this problem by making the achievement of order and discipline in this sector a priority. As part of this approach, integrity measures were mandated across water resources exploration, management, and use in Bangladesh. The Bangladesh Water Integrity Network (BAWIN), with its mandate and strong linkages with WIN and TI-B, as discussed below, can bring in various mechanisms to promote integrity measures in the water sector as well as linked sub-sectors and areas.

BAWIN Composition and Support

BAWIN, launched in 2009, is a multi-stakeholder network of water sector institutions at national and sub-national levels as well as individuals committed to promoting integrity in Bangladesh's water sector through research, campaign, and advocacy; part of this work involves engaging various stakeholders through the technical and financial support of the Berlin-based Water Integrity Network (WIN). BAWIN was launched in 2009 with the involvement of Transparency International Berlin (TI-B) and other organisations working in the water sector. In the current phase, WIN-S supported BAWIN for the period of 2014–2016, in order to ensure the continued functioning of BAWIN as well as the undertaking of key activities.

Vision

BAWIN's vision—to ensure the highest standards of integrity, transparency, and accountability in water management, especially ensuring for the country's poor and disadvantaged the right of access to water for life and livelihood—will not be possible unless both service providers and service receivers are aware of and informed and about their rights and responsibilities. Service receivers must not only know their rights and what services they will receive, but also how to avail these rights and raise their voice accordingly.

In the first year of the current programme (2014–2015), BAWIN concentrated on establishing its networks, as it faced a delayed start resulting from the protracted process of finalizing the agreement and obtaining approval from the NGO Bureau. From 2015, BAWIN, as implemented by WIN, operated at full capacity to promote integrity in the water sector. The funds for the BAWIN programme were provided by the DGIS-supported five-country programme on water integrity, which includes Bangladesh. These country programmes are expected to be mutually reinforcing through a multi-level approach combining advocacy, knowledge sharing, documentation of country cases, and capacity building.

Evaluation

The duration of the agreement between WIN and TI-B for the planned activities of BAWIN was 2014–2016, with the programme ending in February 2017? The agreement stipulated that the programme be evaluated during its end phase. Romina Dewan Kabir, an independent evaluator, was selected to conduct the evaluation. The evaluator was expected to assess the implementation of the BAWIN programme by reviewing its strategic focus areas. The evaluator agreed to carry out review of all planned and implemented activities, to identify achievements and lessons learned. The evaluator was expected to assess the effectiveness of two major aspects of BAWIN:

1. Programme structure, specifically, (a) human resources, (b) management, and (c) network support.
2. Implementation of programme activities, in terms of what was achieved, what was not achieved, what was feasible, and what was difficult. The activities undertaken, according to the Grant Agreement, were the key focus of the evaluation. These included:
 - Promoting integrity in water management
 - Research, knowledge, communications, and advocacy
 - Capacity development
 - Climate Finance Governance (CFG) in collaboration with TI-B
 - Fundraising
 - Conferences and events

Evaluator's Tasks

The evaluator undertook the following tasks:

- Reviewed all relevant reports, proposals, and relevant documents related to the project
- Designed a methodology to evaluate outcomes of the project as stated above
- Identified and conducted semi-structured interviews with a sample of relevant stakeholders, including key informant interviews (KIIs) with WIN, TI-B, and BAWIN management, to gather data on results and outcomes
- Debriefed the TI-B management on findings of the evaluation prior to finalizing the report
- Submitted the draft evaluation report for feedback
- Prepared a final evaluation report incorporating the feedback
- Maintained confidentiality of information gathered during and after the evaluation period

In preparing this report, the evaluator tried primarily to identify (a) BAWIN's achievements and areas of effectiveness, which are discussed below under 'Strengths Identified' and (b) the main challenges or lessons learned, which are discussed below under 'Gaps Identified'. The report also identifies key findings as based on collected data. Focus was also placed on evaluating the impact of the programme, the effectiveness of its objectives, and how far BAWIN's vision progressed towards achievement.

Methodology

A number of standard formal and informal approaches and tools for information collection and analysis were used, including:

- Document review
- Briefing meeting
- Questionnaires
- Semi-structured interviews with different BAWIN network members as well as with the Managing Director (MD) of the Khulna Water and Sewerage Authority (KWASA) and the former Project Coordinator of BAWIN
- KII with WIN and TI-B's Focal Persons
- SWOT and force field analysis with network members to determine the driving and restraining forces to be considered in taking the programme forwards
- Field visit to observe the work of KWASA and meet its MD
- Meetings with the YES and CCC members, some journalists receiving training in water integrity issues, and local TI-B officials
- Consultant's own observations

Overall Findings

BAWIN was to a large extent successful, even though it was implemented over only one year. Planned activities were mostly achieved; however, it has been difficult to measure results due to the lack of a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system. Although the programme's objectives were a bit overly ambitious for two years' time, they were quite relevant to the context, which made it possible to implement most of the activities within the short time and smoothly carry out the advocacy-based activities. The technical support of WIN and TI-B played a significant role in these successes. Two of the programme's primary objectives, that the evaluation found to be very effective implemented, are that of capacity building and the multi-level advocacy strategy. Both evidence- and experience-based work, enabled with thorough research and rich supporting documents, helped to initiate the programme without any problem.

The uniqueness of the multi-level approach to raising public awareness of water integrity issues was quite evident during the evaluation. Even though the BAWIN programme did not have permanent senior staff working on a regular basis, its work was always supervised by TI-B to ensure the proper implementation of activities. Support shown in both print and electronic media throughout the programme implementation period indicated its credibility and acceptance as acting in the public interest.

One of the main areas of achievement and encouragement was to promote PPPP by implementing the Integrity Management (IM) Toolbox at KWASA. Entering a public agency and implementing any new approach within a short time frame is always a challenge.

Implementation of the IM Toolbox has contributed to increased confidence levels among government employees at KWASA. To consolidate gains and promote wider impact and sustainability, more remains to be done in areas of advocacy, primarily by building on initial successes and linking work being undertaken in the implementation areas to the national level through strong partnerships and promotion. For future work, it is essential that to strengthen M&E systems, using clear outcome indicators and developing simple tools to collect data and track progress towards objectives on a regular basis.

BAWIN was able to achieve most of its activities, by using a combination of interventions, during the two-year time frame. These successes have opened the door for achieving the BAWIN's vision, as well as the objectives discussed below.

Achievement of Objectives

Objective: Stimulate public debate and support for integrity in the water sector in Bangladesh by promoting transparency and accountability in policies and actions affecting the sector

To achieve this objective, various activities were carried out, including country a baseline assessment on water sector integrity, implementation of the IM Toolbox at KWASA, observation of World Water Day, and development of awareness-building information, education, and communication (IEC) materials. As per target, most of the activities were achieved. However, these were not enough to stimulate public debate and support for integrity in the water sector.

Objective: Help institutions in the water sector to measurably improve transparency and accountability in polices, programmes, and operations through knowledge and fact-based advocacy, campaign and engagement.

A series of research activities has been undertaken to build knowledge on water integrity issues in the country that can ultimately serve as the basis for advocacy and policy recommendations to the government. A study was undertaken on the Mayur River, but the report is currently being withheld from public distribution due to temporary court order. An effluent treatment plant (ETP) study was also undertaken.

Objective: Facilitate change which improves content and quality of services in the water sector with particular emphasis on sustainable livelihood for all, especially the poor and disadvantaged of society.

To facilitate change, improvement of content and quality of service are both essential. It was commendable that management anticipated these crucial factors during development of the project proposal and also organized a training and workshop on the IM Toolbox for the Integrity Management Coach (IMC), KWASA management, and network members. However, as mentioned earlier, given the short timeline of two years, most the activities.

It is essential to remember that ensuring sustainable livelihood for these groups must include the rights of poor women, children, and disabled people. The evaluation observed that gender was not an explicit component in the project activities undertaken under BAWIN; however, the significant effects of corruption in the water sector on women and girls, cutting across many levels, were consistently highlighted in the numerous advocacy campaigns. Special school-related events were organized to highlight the impact of water sector corruption on children's health and lives. To ensure the inclusion of these issues in long-term programming will be crucial.

Conclusion

Overall, this water integrity initiative has created awareness among the public and created a supportive and enabling environment within the short programme time frame, through multi-level interventions such as public hearings, advocacy-related work, training, and evidence-based research. These interventions helped people working in the sector to become familiar with the term and concept in general, and water integrity in particular, beginning to keep these in mind, whatever their work. This groundwork will help near-future efforts to work towards long-term impact.

Emphasis should be given to creating a level playing field by ensuring programme ownership programme by all, especially the network members, for the betterment of water integrity in general and the Government of Bangladesh in particular, as well as to push members of the public to become

invested in ensuring integrity in their respective areas. Although the overall goal of the project was found to be too ambitious for such a short time frame, through the multiple awareness-training interventions and activities, the base has been created for future work. To take BAWIN forwards and build on this base, greater emphasis should be placed on follow-up, with a proactive approach, and continuing to strengthen the capacities of the people involved on the basis of the recommendations and issues discussed.

INTRODUCTION

Bangladesh is one of the world's most densely populated countries, with its people crammed into a delta of rivers that empties into the Bay of Bengal¹. Poverty is deep and widespread, but Bangladesh has in recent years reduced population growth and improved health and education. Bangladesh was the most populous of the world's least-developed countries (LDCs) but some economists see it now as one of the 'Next Eleven' tier of developing countries, with potential for significant foreign investment-led growth. The low-lying country is vulnerable to flooding and cyclones, and stands to be badly affected by any rises in sea levels.

People in Bangladesh have started to understand and challenge the negative effects of the globalization and have started to raise their voices. Among Bangladesh's challenges are poor quality health and education services and unequal access to those services, especially for the poor and women. TI's Global Corruption Barometer 2006², a survey of the general public conducted in 62 countries, found that bribery in poor and transitional countries is still a major impediment to development. Regardless of development level, effective governance of water resources and related services is of critical importance to sustainable human development and to safeguarding people's livelihoods and living environment. The biggest obstacles to sustainable development in Bangladesh are overpopulation, poor infrastructure, corruption, political instability, and slow implementation of economic reforms.

Corruption in Bangladesh has been a continuing problem. According to all major ranking institutions, Bangladesh routinely finds itself among the most corrupt countries in the world. From 2001 until 2005, Bangladesh was ranked the most corrupt country in the world by Transparency International according to Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI). Although its corruption status started to improve after 2006, the country remains towards the bottom of the list. The latest ranking, published in 2016, placed the country 145th among 176 world countries, with a CPI of 26 out of 100.

Nowhere do citizens, particularly the poor, feel the effects of corruption more directly than at the municipal level. Corruption calls into question the social contract between citizens and public officials, whose duty is to provide vital services

Background

Water is a fundamental resource for sustainable development. It is essential for eradicating poverty, securing food and energy for a rapidly growing population, and maintaining life-sustaining ecosystems for future generations. In most countries, water crises are not due to resource scarcity but primarily to governance failures.

The importance of water and good governance has been recognized in the preparation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), as well as in numerous declarations and conventions. Water integrity exemplifies the transformative shifts identified by the high-level panel, by incorporating a global partnership for the equitable, sustainable, and accountable management of water resources and the services these provide to all societies. Eliminating corruption across water-related sectors and building integrity into policies and action plans will be essential to these ambitions.

The water sector is vulnerable to corruption as a result of large-scale construction projects and large flows of public money (as well as the great need for water, for which there may be no substitute),

¹ www.bbc.com. No date. Country profile: Asia: Bangladesh.

² World Bank. 2009. *Improving Transparency Integrity and Accountability in Water Supply and Sanitation Action, Learning and Experience*. New York: World Bank Institute and Transparency International

reinforced by the powerful positions of suppliers—commonly monopoly providers³. In combination with weak governance systems—including unclear roles and responsibilities among water actors and institutions—corruption may thrive. Water is central to the way of life in Bangladesh and the single-most important resource for the well-being of its people. It sustains an extremely fragile natural environment and provides livelihood for millions of people. As water is essential for human survival, socio-economic development of the country, and preservation of its natural environment, it is the policy of the Government of Bangladesh⁴ that all necessary means and measures be taken to manage the water resources of the country in a comprehensive, integrated, and equitable manner. The policies are designed to ensure continued progress towards fulfilling the national goals of economic development, poverty alleviation, food security, public health and safety, a decent standard of living for the people, and protection of the natural environment.

Bangladesh has suffered from an array of water problems and disasters, both natural and manmade—the latter caused by lack of good governance, corruption, and dysfunctional institutional arrangements. Over the years, the sector has become susceptible to corruption because of the monopolized structure and absence of accountability in decision-making. Corruption diverts resources that could be used to improve water and other services, especially for poor people.

The National Water Policy 1999 recognizes Bangladesh as a water-dependent country which suffers from a level of chaos in management institutions, and seeks to remedy to this problem by prioritizing the development of order and discipline to this sector. Therefore, integrity measures were required for exploration, management, and use of water resources in Bangladesh. BAWIN, with its mandate and strong linkages with WIN-S and TI-B, can bring in various mechanisms to promote integrity measures in the water sector as well as linked sub-sectors and areas.

Water Integrity Network and TI-B

WIN is a network of organisations and individuals promoting water integrity to reduce corruption and improve water sector performance worldwide. WIN works to raise awareness about the impact of corruption, especially on the poor and disenfranchised; assesses risk; and promotes practical responses. The network's vision is a world with equitable and sustained access to water and a clean environment, which are no longer threatened by corruption, greed, dishonesty, and willful malpractice.

Transparency International is an international non-governmental organisation based in Berlin, Germany, and was founded in 1993. Its non-profit purpose is to take action to combat corruption and prevent criminal activities arising from corruption. Transparency International Bangladesh (TI-B) is the Bangladeshi branch of the Berlin-based Transparency International, a civil society organisation dedicated to fighting corruption.

Bangladesh Water Integrity Network

BAWIN is a multi-stakeholder network of water sector institutions at national and sub-national levels, as well as individuals, committed to promoting integrity in the water sector in Bangladesh through research, campaigns, and advocacy which engages various stakeholders with technical and financial support from Berlin-based WIN. The Bangladesh Water Integrity Network was launched in 2009, with the involvement of TI-B and other organisations working in the water sector. In the current phase, WIN-S is supporting BAWIN for 2014–2016 to further continue the functioning of BAWIN and to ensure that key activities are undertaken.

³ Water Governance Facility (website). Programmes: Water Integrity –Water Integrity Programme –Challenges; first paragraph.

⁴ Water Resources Planning Organization. 1999. *National Water Policy 1999* [English]. Foreword by the Prime Minister. Available at: www.mowr.gov.bd.

In the first year of this phase, BAWIN concentrated on establishing its networks, owing to a delayed start caused by the protracted process of finalizing the agreement and obtaining approval from the NGO Bureau. From 2015, BAWIN operated at its full capacity to promote integrity in the water sector, as implemented by WIN. Funding for the BAWIN programme was supplied by the DGIS-supported five-country programme on water integrity, which includes Bangladesh. These country programmes will be mutually reinforcing through a multi-level approach that combines advocacy, knowledge sharing, documentation of country cases, and capacity building.

Vision of BAWIN

BAWIN's vision is a water sector in Bangladesh which represents the highest standards of integrity, transparency, and accountability so that the population, especially the poor and the disadvantaged, are ensured their right of access to water for life and livelihood without being affected by governance deficit and corruption.

Objectives of BAWIN

- Stimulate public debate and support for integrity in the water sector in Bangladesh by promoting transparency and accountability in policies and actions affecting the sector
- Help institutions in the water sector to measurably improve transparency and accountability in policies, programmes, and operations through knowledge and fact-based advocacy, campaigns, and engagement
- Facilitate change which improves the content and quality of services in the water sector, with particular emphasis on sustainable livelihood for all, especially the poor and disadvantaged

BAWIN Organisational/Corporate Members

- Bangladesh Water Partnership (NGO and network of water-related organisations)
- Transparency International Bangladesh (INGO)
- Water Aid in Bangladesh (INGO)
- NGO Forum for Drinking Water Supply and Sanitation (WASH) (NGO)
- Bangladesh Poribesh Andolon (network for the environment)
- VOICE (rights-based NGO)
- Bangladesh Centre for Advanced Studies (research institution)
- BRAC (large-scale WASH programme in BRAC)
- Nagorik Uddyog (citizens' network, national NGO)
- LEDERS (climate change-related NGO in the coastal area)
- Institute of Water and Environment (think tank)
- Initiative for Right View (rights-based NGO in the coastal area)

Roles, Responsibilities, and Reporting Lines

BAWIN

- The lead principle for the use of programme funds by BAWIN will be to maximize leverage in accordance with WIN's Global Strategy 2011–2016.
- BAWIN's responsibilities include:
 - Coordinate activities from its core and programme funding
 - Endeavour to find complementary funding from other sources

- Plan and implement programme activities
- Develop annual plan and budget
- Network with partners
- Conduct advocacy, from local to national level
- Develop and share knowledge
- The overall programme, including all country components, will be advised by and will consult strategically with the BAWIN Executive Board and BAWIN Steering Group.
- BAWIN will report directly to TI-B and consult on a regular basis with WIN-S.

WIN

- WIN will have a dedicated staff member for backstopping the BAWIN programme.
- WIN responsibilities include:
 - Provide quality assurance
 - Monitor progress
 - Provide technical and tools support
 - Handle global advocacy
 - Take the lead on regional capacity building
 - Ensure proper programme documentation

TI-B

TI-B responsibilities include:

- Assure effective implementation of BAWIN programme activities
- Provide backstopping, administration, and quality assurance of the country programmes
- Monitor progress
- Host the Secretariat of BAWIN
- Produce reports (narrative and financial)
- Provide technical and tools support
- Report on the use of its proper financial resources to allow TI/WIN-S to monitor these contributions and include this in its reporting to DGIS

EVALUATION OBJECTIVES, STRUCTURE, METHODOLOGY, AND LIMITATIONS

The duration of the agreement between WIN and TI-B for the planned activities of BAWIN was 2014–2016 and the programme ended in February 2017, after a short extension. It was stipulated in the contract that the programme would be evaluated during its end phase; Romina Dewan Kabir, an independent evaluator, was selected to conduct the evaluation. The evaluator was expected to assess the implementation of the BAWIN programme by reviewing its strategic focus areas. The evaluator agreed to evaluate the planned and implemented activities in order to identify the programme's achievements and lessons learned.

Specific Objectives

The evaluation was carried out according to two overall objectives, each of which focuses on specific programme areas and activities.

Objective 1: Evaluate Effectiveness of the Programme Structure

The consultant assessed the structural effectiveness of the programme, particularly:

- Human resources
- Management
- Network support

Objective 2: Evaluate the Implementation of Programme Activities

The consultant set out to evaluate the overall set of activities which was planned under BAWIN—what could be achieved, what was not achieved, what was feasible, and what was difficult. The key focus of the evaluation was a review of these activities undertaken according to the Grant Agreement:

- Promotion of integrity in water management
 - A country baseline assessment/report on *Water Sector Integrity in Bangladesh*
 - Implementation of the Integrity Management (IM) Toolbox at KWSA
 - Observation of World Water Day and development of awareness-building information, education, and communication (IEC) materials
- Research, knowledge, communications, and advocacy
 - Several studies related to water integrity
 - Meeting with BAWIN advisory and network members
 - Advocacy activities, such as media training, campaigns, public hearings, and video documentary
- Capacity development
 - Training and workshop on IM Toolbox for Integrity Management Coach (IMC), KWSA management, and network members
- Climate Finance Governance (CFG) of TI-B
 - Rally and discussion sessions on water integrity
 - Research on governance, transparency, and integrity risk issues of Bangladesh Water Development Board (BWDB) covering climate change fund operation
- Fundraising
 - Submission of draft proposal to Blue Gold programme, funded by the Embassy of the Netherlands (which did not receive any response)

- Arrangement of meeting with Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) to discuss potential funding options
- Participation in conferences and events
 - Stockholm World Water Week (SWWW) and South Asian Conference on Sanitation (SACOSAN) VI in 2015
 - SWWW in 2016
 - TI Climate Finance Transparency and Integrity Workshop in 2016

Evaluator's Tasks

The evaluator performed the following tasks:

- Reviewed all relevant reports, proposals, and documents on the project
- Designed a methodology to evaluate outcomes of the project
- Identified and conducted semi-structured interviews with a sample of relevant stakeholders, including key informant interviews (KIIs) with WIN, TI-B, and BAWIN management to gather data on results and outcomes
- Debriefed TI-B management on findings of the evaluation prior to finalizing the draft report
- Submitted the draft evaluation report for feedback
- Prepared a final evaluation report incorporating the feedback
- Maintained confidentiality of information gathered during and after the evaluation period

Methodology and Approach

The consultant designed the work plan (Annex 1a) on the basis of the terms of reference after discussion with the BAWIN Project Officer. The plan was developed to ensure the availability of the relevant individuals. 'Participation' as a sign of empowerment and a concept of inclusion was one of the core values of the review process. Time constraints meant that it was not possible to carry out some of the activities as per the work plan; therefore, the plan was slightly adapted (Annex 1b).

This report seeks mainly to bring out BAWIN's achievements and level of effectiveness, as well as the main challenges or lessons learned. It also provides key findings based on the collected data. In addition, it seeks to measure the impact of the programme, effectiveness of the objectives, and the extent to which the vision of BAWIN was on its way to achievement.

A number of standard approaches for information collection and analysis were used, including (a) document review and (b) briefing meetings.

In addition, a number of informal and formal data collection tools were used, including:

- Questionnaires. The consultant used a standard questionnaire to survey responses about the effectiveness of the programme. These were used in different ways and as appropriate for different types of respondents.
- Semi-structured interviews with a number of BAWIN network members (see Annex 2) as well as with the MD of KWASA and the former Project Coordinator of BAWIN
- Key informant interviews with WIN and TI-B Focal Persons (see Annex 3)

- SWOT and force field analysis with BAWIN network members to assess the strengths weaknesses, opportunities, and threats as well as the driving and restraining forces to be considered in taking the programme forwards
- Field visit to observe the work of KWASA and meet the MD, as well as meetings with YES and CCC members (see annex 4), journalists who received training on water integrity issues, and local TI-B officials
- Consultant observations

Limitations of the Review

The agreement was signed to conduct the review from 16th January with submission of a draft report on 2nd February but as a result of unavoidable circumstances, the evaluator was not able to conduct as thorough a field visit as planned. The evaluator tried to meet and talk to as many relevant respondents as possible during the course of this evaluation and made a field visit to KWASA. Some CCC and YES group members, along with journalists who received training on water integrity issues, were also present during the field visit. However, those met represented only a sub-set of programme participants, as the evaluator had only one day to observe the KWASA activity.

FINDINGS: DOCUMENT REVIEW ON TOOLS, RESEARCH, AND ADVOCACY ACTIVITIES

The consultant obtained a large number of important documents, which had been generated for the smooth implementation of the initiative. Some documents were related to the formation and design of BAWIN. A list of documents reviewed is attached in Annex 5. The review process identified both strengths and gaps in documentation.

Strengths Identified

BAWIN

- Rich supporting documents were created to start work on the water sector.
- The documents gave a clear picture of the initiation of the network and its implementation, as well as a general idea of BAWIN.
- A baseline report was in place to guide the programme's work in the water sector in response to identified needs. It also provided a clear picture of the water integrity situation and the organisations working in the water sectors.
- Annual reports detailing the status of the activities provided a clear picture of activities carried out during the programme period, as well as what could not be achieved and why. These helped to clarify how far BAWIN was able to progress with most of activities (see Annex 6).
- Most of the information was up-to-date.
- The meetings were well noted, demonstrating the seriousness of TI-B and BAWIN management.
- Posters and leaflets were in place for public awareness raising.
- Newspaper clippings served as strong evidence of print media support, especially major national newspaper reports on advocacy campaigns (see Annex 7).
- A research study was conducted on land and water grabbing on the Mayur River which explored the issues of encroachment and pollution in depth. The report has not yet been shared with the public, as a relevant case about seizure along the river is making its way through the courts.
- A significant study was jointly conducted with TI-B's Climate Finance Governance Programme which focused on tracking climate change investments made in water-related projects in Bangladesh. The findings led the government to undertake mitigation measures to help in strengthening the integrity of climate-related projects in Bangladesh. Research and tracking of climate investments in water projects remains ongoing and periodic reports are being developed by TI-B.
- A study was conducted to assess the effectiveness and installation of effluent treatment plants (ETPs) in the garment sector and the implications for water sector integrity. Findings have not yet been shared with network members, as the study was carried out during the end phase of programme work. The ETPs are mandatory by law but many garment industries violate these regulations.

KWASA

- The early success of the IM Toolbox in building capacity at KWASA is encouraging.
- The use of the monitoring tool, to follow up KWASA activities and evaluate the effectiveness of the IMC's IM Toolbox training, is evidence of successful implementation.
- With the coach's guidance, the KWASA MD and his team developed an action plan for improving integrity management.
- BAWIN and WIN shared KWASA success stories on their websites.

- Four major television channels broadcast a documentary on KWASA’s successful implementation of the IM Toolbox, indicating strong support from the electronic media.
- Reports on the BAWIN-supported public hearing in Khulna appeared in nine local newspapers and two national newspapers, enhancing public awareness of BAWIN’s work in the city.

Gaps Identified

BAWIN

- The lack of a descriptive monitoring indicator/tool makes it more difficult to track the gradual progress of activities.
- A standard observation tool is needed to follow up after capacity development trainings, as the lack of an in-built tool made it difficult to monitor the translation of training knowledge in the field.
- No records were kept following up on decisions taken during advisory and network members meetings.
- Some of the recommendations of the baseline report were not implemented—a significant gap. For example, no monitoring tool was developed to track progress on the institutionalization of the Right to Information (RTI Act) to ensure public access to information.
- Some major activities remained undone, due to time limits and the ambitiousness of scope for the programme duration. Examples include development of communications materials, identification of government officials for capacity building, documentation of case studies on good practices, and commissioning of media stories.

KWASA

- KWASA took no action to publicize its success in implementing the IM Toolbox through external outlets such as newsletters, posters, or leaflets. The news appeared only on its website, limiting accessibility to a small group of people with Internet access.

FINDINGS: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS

As part of data collection, semi-structured interviews were conducted with some network members and the former BAWIN Project Coordinator. A standard questionnaire (shown in Annexes 8a and 8b) was prepared for use during the discussion. Some questions varied according to respondent, depending on the nature of their work. The questions began with soliciting their opinion of how their behaviour had changed after becoming involved with BAWIN as well as their opinions about the network. Did it ease their work on water integrity issues? How important was it for them? All network members shared a very positive view about the initiation of BAWIN as a network.

Strengths Identified

BAWIN

- Network members felt positively about partnering with TI-B as members of BAWIN.
- They indicated that BAWIN helped to formalize and focus their work on water integrity issues.
- Members reported a change in behaviour, indicating that they now view their work from a water integrity perspective especially that related to policy matters.
- They reported now seeking to ensure transparency and accountability in all of their work, whether public health, sanitation, or other issues.
- They expressed appreciation for now having a common platform for discussion of water integrity issues.
- Members appreciated the network as a water integrity ‘umbrella’, where they can turn for expertise or with any kind of problem.
- Some members were eager to take things forwards and share the cost and activity, if necessary.
- They were eager to provide any kind of support to carry on this work in cooperation with TI-B.
- All of members, especially Water Aid, expressed readiness to share in any activities with TI-B.
- The NGO Forum was keen to support capacity building activities, such as the IM Toolbox—for example, using their own branding with the Chittagong Water Supply and Sewerage Authority (CWASA).
- The WASH Alliance suggested using their advocacy skill to involve political leaders for their support on strengthening water integrity.

KWASA

- The MD of KWASA was very positive about his work and BAWIN's involvement.
- He also expressed appreciation for his team's committing to progress and not resisting change.
- He noted that the large overlap between the IM Toolbox and their job descriptions encouraged easy acceptance without resistance.
- He noted that, having seen the benefit of implementing the IM Toolbox, KWASA is now invested in pursuing a greater focus on water integrity issues.
- The MD noted that the tool also benefitted the government by increasing revenue in the water sector.

Gaps Identified

BAWIN

- Network respondents felt that BAWIN's scope was too ambitious, planning for too many activities within a short time frame.
- Members pointed out a lack of coordination and communication among network members and between network members and BAWIN.
- Members indicated that the absence of full-time senior staff at BAWIN hampered smooth implementation of activities and slowed down communication with network members.

KWASA

- The MD expressed concern about the sustainability of the IM Toolbox training.
- He reporting having faced initial difficulty in implementing the IM Toolbox due to employees' qualifications and understanding level at the outset.
- He expressed a need to follow up the project to the next phase to ensure sustainability of achieved results and attain further improvement.

FINDINGS: KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS

As part of data collection, KIIs were conducted with the WIN and TI-B Focal Persons, to obtain their opinion about the future of the programme. It was reported that WIN is eager to take the work forwards to support continued success at KWASA, as TI-B is unable to include the activities in its core programme before 2019. WIN and TI-B will, however, continue to work together. For the CWASA project, the NGO Forum will be the main implementing partner. WIN is very keen to continue the collaboration with TI-B, but will also begin engaging with partner organisations as part of the country strategy. TI-B intends to integrate water sector integrity as one of its core focus areas after completion of its current project, BIBEC, in September 2019, with the advent of the next project cycle in October 2019. TI-B plans to institutionalize BAWIN using a bottom-up approach. Because of the plan to merge water integrity into its core programme, core TI-B staff have already received training on the use of the IM Toolbox. TI-B considers that due to their expertise in integrity issues, awareness of water integrity as a concept has to some extent become a 'success' and the term has entered the common vocabulary.

FINDINGS: SWOT AND FORCE FIELD ANALYSIS

To assess the effect of the project at beneficiary and community levels and to evaluate the efficiency and adequacy of project implementation—including activity timelines and progress—SWOT analysis was carried out with network members as well as with some of the KII respondents (as many as possible, in order to enrich the findings). SWOT and Force Field Analysis were used to augment the findings the consultant was able to draw from respondents, given limited time to conduct the interviews. Respondents were asked to identify strengths and weaknesses as well as opportunities and threats of BAWIN as a whole to further clarify their thoughts about BAWIN, the challenges it experienced, or how to take it forwards.

Most felt that BAWIN had a very efficient staff but that the number of staff was inadequate to demand, which became a weakness at the later stages, limiting the ability to successfully carry out many activities within the short project time frame. In addition, a frequent change of staff was identified as hindering BAWIN's ability to work to plan. It was noted that, despite BAWIN's inability to work with the Dhaka Water and Sewerage Authority (DWASA) due to a difference of perception around country assessment report findings and DWASA's unwillingness to engage with TI-B, the success of the KWASA IM Toolbox activity, if promoted, can provide an opportunity to mainstream this IM tool at other public agencies. Some respondents saw a great opportunity for BAWIN to go forwards because of its support from TI-B, which has credibility as a well-respected international organisation. Some perceived that engaging and collaborating with TI-B could lead to confrontation with the government since corruption is a sensitive topic, and hence they were cautious. They also believed that in addition to its efficient staff, BAWIN drew great advantage from the very efficient working group formed by the network. All members of the advisory group had a good working experience and good linkage with the public agencies. However, not fully leveraging these good linkages is a weakness for BAWIN, they suggested. All respondents shared that the socio-political context is also a major threat. They observed that WIN and TI-B's experience at international level with a multi-stakeholder partnership approach and networking, as well as well-defined policies for promoting water integrity as an international standard, helped BAWIN to move forward. However, respondents felt that inadequate consultation among network members on national-level advocacy, as well as a lack of experience engaging with Local Government Institutions (LGIs), hampered the smooth implementation of advocacy activities.

Strengths

- Efficient staff
- Strong working group
- Strong financial support
- International-level experience
- Well-defined policies and strategies

Weaknesses

- Absence of permanent senior staff
- Frequent change of staff
- Lack of experience working with LGIs
- Inadequate consultation among network members for national-level advocacy

Opportunities

- Demand for strong alliance/platform for conducting advocacy and lobbying to ensure good governance
- Strengthening capacity of LGIs and network partners
- Willing network members

Threats

- TI-B seen as a risk by government due to its work on sensitive issues of anti-corruption
Communication gap between BAWIN and CCCs of Khulna
- TI-B's relationship with the national government
- Socio-political context

FINDINGS: FIELD VISIT

The consultant visited the field in the second half of January to assess the effect of the project at beneficiary level and evaluate its overall impact. Following BAWIN's success in Khulna, the consultant visited the city to meet the relevant stakeholders, including KWASA's MD, CCC and YES group members, and journalists. Discussion also took place with the representative TI-B officer in Khulna. During the field visit, the consultant conducted semi-structured interviews, as well as held workshops to do SWOT and problem-tree analysis with the relevant group as needed. The visit afforded the opportunity to observe the situation as well as cross-check some of the information collected through document review with network members stationed in Dhaka. Although TI-B did not have a designated, separate office for BAWIN, full support was provided during the field visit, an indication of TI-B's efficient organisational and managerial capacity. SWOT analysis was also conducted with the CCC and YES members present. Discussion focused on what forces could drive BAWIN and what factors might restrain it from moving forwards, based on their experience. They also were asked to suggest some solutions to the challenges they faced. The CCC members, YES group members, and two journalists participated in a group workshop, sharing their ideas about BAWIN and KWASA's strengths and challenges, as well as possible solutions. Their thoughts are captured below.



Strengths and Gaps Identified

BAWIN

- Involvement of government agencies such as KWASA, a reputable organisation like TI-B, other NGOs, CCCs, youth, journalists, and other media constitute a great strength, especially in terms of raising public awareness. If buy-in from these stakeholders continues this can strongly boost BAWIN going forwards, enhancing the outlook for sustainability.
- The ability of CCCs to leverage greater local support has not been effectively tapped.
- CCCs are not always well informed about BAWIN's overall goals and vision, although they participated in a variety of issue-based activities when invited, with much enthusiasm.
- Journalists indicated a greater capacity in reporting on water integrity issues after their participation in training.
- At the same time, their training lacked a follow-up element, with the result of weakening its practical effect.
- YES members also expressed a need for proper guidance and mentoring in sensitive and technical water integrity issues, as they were quite motivated to be involved and carry on with the work.

KWASA

- The MD of KWASA shared that, as a public servant, he tried to use his office and power in a positive way.
- He noted that he did not wait for bureaucratic approvals to implement the IM Toolbox, but used his own authority to move ahead.
- He expressed the importance of partnering with BAWIN for the benefit of the people of Khulna.

CONSULTANT OBSERVATIONS

During the evaluation process, the consultant developed her own observations. These were developed throughout her work—for example, during document review, field visits, and workshops, in talking with the network members, as well as staff and management of BAWIN. The observation is categorized in the following sub-heads for better understanding.

Strengths Identified: BAWIN

Human Resources, Management, and Network Support

- Three strong and efficient management teams of both WIN and TI-B provided a solid start for the BAWIN programme.
- Most of the Project Coordinators and Project Officers selected were well qualified, with relevant education and working experience in the water sector.
- BAWIN maintained a very good relationship with network members.
- Network members relied on BAWIN and TI-B for any kind of water integrity issue.
- WIN and TI-B's experience in water integrity issues helped BAWIN to initiate its activities smoothly.
- Network members are active and interested in carrying BAWIN's work forwards.
- The people in the field are also quite positive about addressing water integrity issues.
- BAWIN has earned support from print and electronic media to raise general public awareness about water integrity issues.
- TI-B and BAWIN staff were regularly present during the advisory and network members meetings.
- The ability of TI-B management to step in to effectively handle a BAWIN staff problem helped to ensure continuity of the programme.
- The current BAWIN Project Officer efficiently administered the end phase of the programme.
- Meeting minutes were well maintained.
- BAWIN was able to carry out most of its stated programme activities within the short two-year time frame.

Advocacy and Research

- A number of water integrity advocacy events, as well as campaigns involving various BAWIN members and other organizations, were carried out. In addition, to build awareness among the public, campaigns—especially on World Water Day in various regions of Bangladesh—and events were organized at various schools also to highlight the issue of corruption in the water sector. BAWIN participated in forums and conferences highlighting the issue of integrity and sharing some of their research findings on water integrity. Press campaigns were carried out, including the sharing of integrity concerns about the Dhaka Water and Sewerage Authority (DWASA), which led to a series of meetings and public statements from both TI-B and DWASA.
- As a result of these of advocacy campaigns and related activities, members of the public has some awareness of water integrity issues aspect and are gradually changing their behaviour.
- A series of research activities has been launched to build knowledge on water integrity issues in the country which can ultimately feed into advocacy and policy recommendations for the government. This push needs to be monitored and backed for full implementation. For

example, a research study was conducted on the issues of land and water grabbing on the Mayur River.

- Another significant study was jointly carried out with TI-B's Climate Finance Governance Programme, which focused on tracking climate investments made in water-related projects in Bangladesh. The findings led the government to undertake mitigation measures to help in strengthen the integrity of climate-related projects in Bangladesh. Research and tracking of climate investments in water projects remains ongoing and periodic reports are developed by TI-B.
- A study was also undertaken to assess the effectiveness and instalment of effluent treatment plants in the garment sector as well as the implications for water sector integrity. Findings have not yet been shared with network members, as the study was carried out during the end phase of BAWIN programme work. The ETPs are mandatory by law but many garment industries violate these norms.
- Strong documentation, research, and evidence-based studies provided by WIN and TI-B will be effective in persuading stakeholders as well as the public to join with BAWIN activities spontaneously.
- BAWIN benefits from TI-B's good reputation and very strong media connections.

Training and Capacity Building

- Capacity development is a major thematic area of BAWIN and is critical for the success of the program. As the concept of water integrity is relatively new in the development sector, there is a high demand for increasing the capacity of the relevant stakeholders. BAWIN is to be commended for taking steps to build the capacity of all the relevant groups on water integrity issues.
- Involvement of students through study circles and YES group members encourages them to act as change agents; it is important to ensure their sustained knowledge and engagement through careful follow-up and monitoring.
- The training of TI-B's core staff on the IM Toolbox is a positive step which will help to ensure that the work is carried out in a systematic way going forwards.

Local-Level Support

- The existence of various local-level committees will help in achieving BAWIN's goals and ensuring water integrity in the respective areas.
- Local-level civil society groups such as the CCCs and YES, as well as the trained Khulna journalists, were all positive about taking BAWIN activities forwards. If these groups maintain a sense of ownership of the programme, they will be beneficial in helping BAWIN move towards effective achievement of its goals.
- Enhanced participation of stakeholders has increased the utilities' transparency. During the KWASA office visit, the consultant observed an employee communicating respectfully with a customer about a water bill, which she considers one of the indicators of integrity. People at the agencies are now shifting to see everything through an integrity lens.

Strengths Identified: KWASA

- KWASA is a good example of improved management information systems for billing, accounting, and human resources management.
- The mainstreaming of the IM Toolbox in public institute like KWASA deserves special citation, as it is very challenging to mainstream any initiative, especially within this short span of time.

- The training had a positive impact on KWASA in large part because the manager himself was positive and understood the importance of the IM Toolbox. With his strong and enthusiastic leadership his team all made positive changes in their behaviour. Moreover, as the priorities set out in the tool aligned with their responsibilities, they did not resist the change.
- The holding of public hearings on KWASA activities, if continued, will have a positive impact on the public, as people will have the opportunity to share their problems; KWASA will also be held accountable and their activities made transparent to the public gradually.
- Training workshops were undertaken to build the capacity of individuals to serve as Integrity Management Coaches for projects similar to the implementation of the IM Toolbox at KWASA. These coaches will support further projects with WASAs in Bangladesh.
- Implementation of the IM Toolbox at KWASA along with a regular programme of public hearings will provide an opportunity for promoting people-public-private partnership (PPPP) in place of PPP.
- The video documentary on KWASA is commendable as a tool for encouraging other officials working in the public agencies. Disseminating it through private channels will have a positive impact. Steps should be taken to broadcast it on a government-owned channel such as BTV.

Gaps Identified: BAWIN

Human Resources, Management, and Network Support

- In the consultant's opinion, the ambitious nature of BAWIN's objectives combined with a large number of activities to be carried out in a short time frame led to an emphasis of quantity of activities over quality of activities.
- Frequent changes of BAWIN staff made it difficult to implement many of planned and important activities. In addition, an inadequate number of staff, given the high number of activities, created problems in maintaining quality and monitoring the work effectively.
- As per the Grant Agreement between WIN and TI-B, BAWIN is responsible for coordination, planning and implementation, development of plan and budget, maintaining the partners' network, and many more activities. All these required a permanent senior staff member, to take ownership of the programme and provide support accordingly. TI-B was to assure effective implementation of BAWIN programme activities, but due to their other commitments were not able to concentrate fully or allocate time to address any problems promptly, which sometimes delayed activities or hampered the smooth implementation.
- Most of the network members based in Dhaka, did not yet have a sense of ownership of the programme; they consider BAWIN to be mainly the concern of TI-B, as they have the expertise in integrity issue. Moreover, these network members are occupied with their own work and objectives. As a result, it was observed that the base which was created remained unstable and somewhat weak to stand on.

Advocacy, Research, and Fundraising

- Although meeting minutes of the advisory members and network members were well maintained, they did not reflect the decisions taken following the meetings. It was only recorded that the minute was unanimously adopted. Therefore, it was unclear which decisions were taken into consideration after the meeting for advocacy campaigns (Annex 9 provides an extract of meeting minutes).
- Although the representatives from TI-B and BAWIN were in regular attendance at network meetings, there was no fixed member representing the networks who attended on a regular

basis. As a result, network members were not all reliably aware and informed on all BAWIN's advocacy activities on water integrity issues.

- Because TI-B is a corruption 'watch dog' in Bangladesh, the organisation has a somewhat contentious relationship with the government, which had an overall impact on BAWIN's programme and activities in the sense that it was difficult to engage with public stakeholders such as DWASA in a heavily politicized environment.
- The consultant observed that TI-B itself had very strong media connections, but these have been underused for conveying success stories. This neglected area of media communications hindered TI-B from working as effectively as it could.
- Efforts to raise funds for the continuation of BAWIN activities from Blue Gold and JICA was not positive as of the writing of the report. This may be related to the relative lack of dissemination of BAWIN success stories through media or network members.

Training and Capacity Building

- All trainings lacked structured follow-up whereby people can share their training-related experience on a common platform and provide each other encouragement. One slot training in particular, which aimed to cultivate media and students as change agents, was negatively affected by the lack of follow-up monitoring; results are left wholly dependent on individuals working alone unsupported to translate the new knowledge into action.
- There was a lack of guideline documents for participants to refer to after training as an aid to further development. The trainings were quite effective, especially the one targeting journalists and YES group members. If they were provided a guideline document, they could have turned to this source for clarification if needed.
- BAWIN had a plan to identify government officials from different departments, who could work as change agents. With the exception of KWASA officials, the programme was not able to identify or train other government officials due to time constraints.

Monitoring and Evaluation

- Monitoring is the continuous observation of a project's progress by systematically gathering key performance data for regular analysis. The programme lacked a descriptive monitoring indicator (with band descriptor) to show the gradual progress of training knowledge and implementation.
- Building the capacity of different groups through a systematic training programme is an important step but the absence of effective M&E is a major problem for its sustainability.

Local-Level Support

- To ensure an enabling environment, BAWIN's water integrity activities should involve not only KWASA but also other public agencies working in the water sector—such as KDA, City Corporation, other local-level institutions—because water integrity issues are relevant wherever public water services are involved.
- The CCC and YES members do not yet feel fully vested in BAWIN's programme, as there is communication gap and misunderstanding among them about their roles and responsibilities. The consultant felt that making a small compensation for their involvement might encourage them. Their presence during the workshop for the evaluation on short notice proved their concerns about water integrity issues.

Gaps Identified: KWASA

- The IM Toolbox needs to be customized and attractive for standardized, 'off-the-shelf' use at KWASA in the absence of a coach or trainer.
- KWASA had a very good monitoring system for toolbox use, but it was dependent on the coach, who was external, creating risks for sustainability.
- The success story of KWASA was not shared among the wider community; only some leaflets and posters were distributed during the public hearing on KWASA without any pictorial message.

Conclusions

Overall, BAWIN deserves commendation for the success of this two-year programme. Most of the network member groups involved with water integrity issues became quite confident and vocal and are motivated to work. However, as they are not fully strengthened through continuous monitoring and mentoring support, they are at risk of sliding backwards. Nevertheless, it is noteworthy that BAWIN was able to create a base for addressing water integrity issues within a short time frame: this base needs strong, constant support if it is to continue functioning.

IMPACT AND EFFECTIVENESS OF THE PROGRAMME

Impact is defined as the positive and negative, primary and secondary, long-term effects produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended⁵.

Overall, it is encouraging to note that although the BAWIN activities were implemented for just two years—establishing its networks in the first year and only from 2015 beginning to operate at full capacity—the evaluation found that, to a large extent, what was planned was achieved. Although it has been difficult to measure results due to the lack of a comprehensive M&E system, but its effect was visible if not the impact. It is too early to measure the impact.

Unfortunately, the late finalization of BAWIN's research activities, challenges with the complexity of the analysis, and the limited time to respond to and integrate findings into the current project cycle affected the use of the findings as part of a coherent advocacy strategy with links to the local and national level. It is anticipated that in a possible second phase, if BAWIN continues, the findings would be integrated into the advocacy activities to ensure local to national linkages. It is also recommended that advocacy activities be implemented with civil society coalitions like the further engagement of CCCs and YES members, as well as local-level water bodies and similar groups, in order to increase the potential to achieve lasting impact.

This water integrity initiative has created awareness among the public and created a supportive and enabling environment through different kinds of intervention from different sides, including public hearing, advocacy-related work, training, and evidence-based research. All these helped people working in this sector to acclimate to the term Integrity in general and water integrity in particular, and to keep these mind during their work. It is expected that these activities will help seed a longer-term impact in the near future. Network members were initially quite to be supported by reputable international organizations like WIN and TI-B, their technical and intellectual support was not properly used due to limited communication with the network members. This was further hampered in the last year of the programme due to the absence of full-time senior staff at BAWIN to monitor and coordinate with the members. To assess the programme's impact, a robust M&E system is needed to allow a set of realistic outcome indicators to be measured in a systematic way. The lack of descriptive monitoring and follow-up of the activities in a structured way made it impossible to determine the effectiveness of the good-quality training and awareness programme, and served to undermine somewhat the base created by the network.

⁵ According to the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), and which has been adopted by the International Labour Organization (ILO) along with most other United Nations agencies and development agencies.

ACHIEVEMENTS IN RELATION TO VISION AND OBJECTIVES

Outcomes are defined as medium-term effects of project outputs. Outcomes are observable changes that can be linked to project interventions. Usually, they are the achievements of the project. BAWIN was able to achieve most of its activities through various interventions during the two-year time frame. It has opened the door for achieving the vision and objectives discussed below.

Vision

BAWIN's vision is a water sector in Bangladesh that represents the highest standards of integrity, transparency, and accountability so that the people at large, especially the poor and the disadvantaged, are ensured of their right of access to water for life and livelihood without being affected by government neglect and corruption. This vision will not be attainable if both service providers and service receivers are not aware and informed about their rights and responsibilities. To ensure transparency and integrity, the service provider must know their responsibility; the service receiver must know their rights or what services they will receive, how to avail these rights, and how raise their voice as needed. This vision was a bit too ambitious for a programme of just two years.

Objectives

Objective: Stimulate public debate and support for integrity in the water sector in Bangladesh by promoting transparency and accountability in policies and actions affecting the sector

To achieve this objective, a variety of activities, such as the country baseline assessment on water sector integrity in Bangladesh, implementation of the IM Toolbox at KWASA, observation of World Water Days, and development of awareness-building IEC materials were planned. As per target most of the activities were carried out; nevertheless, these were not sufficient to fully stimulate public debate and support for integrity in the water sector. The IM Toolbox was able to have an effect in the sector; although it was not yet able to promote transparency and accountability in water policy in general, it was quite successful with KWASA in having some impact on their work and standards. KWASA is an example of success but mainstreaming the IM Toolbox across the water sector and water policies is long way ahead. IEC materials need to be much more focused on positive news to motivate people by demonstrating what can be achieved if integrity is ensured and how this is possible with more awareness training at all levels. In addition, the trainings held for groups such as journalists and the study circle were good, a fragile monitoring system weakened the ability of these activities to achieve the objective. It will be important, however, to continue training with students and young professionals who are willing to change; and to develop positive information campaigns using leaflets or newsletters with both stories and pictures.

Objective: Help institutions in the water sector to measurably improve transparency and accountability in policies, programmes, and operations through knowledge- and fact-based advocacy campaigns and engagement

Knowledge- and fact-based advocacy is always crucial and carries weight as people want to see evidence of benefit in order to improve and change. To achieve this objective, several activities were carried out: studies related to water integrity, meeting with BAWIN advisory and network members, and advocacy activities—such as media training, campaigns, public hearing, and video documentary. As part of this effort, a series of research activities was undertaken to build knowledge on water integrity issues in the country which can ultimately feed into advocacy and policy recommendations for the government. A study on the Mayur River was conducted but the report has not yet been

released to the public due to judicial delay. A study on the integrity aspects of the garments and textiles industry complying with ETP standards was also undertaken.

Some of the institutions representing the network have already improved their policies, but for public agencies this will take some time. Two years is not enough time to achieve this objective or to complete and disseminate findings from the number of studies undertaken.

Objective: Facilitate change that improves content and quality of services in the water sector with particular emphasis on sustainable livelihood of all, especially the poor and disadvantaged sections of the society

To facilitate change, improvement of content and quality of service are both essential. It was commendable that management anticipated these important factors during development of the programme proposal. As a result of this foresight, they organized a training and workshop on the IM Toolbox for Integrity Management Coach, KWASA management, and network members. However, as mentioned above, most of the activities were not wide enough in scope to achieve the ambitious goals in two years' time. It is unclear whether the objectives followed the SMART technique to improve the content and provide quality services in the water sector with particular emphasis on sustainable livelihood for all by specifying clearly the activities. To ensure sustainable livelihood, especially for the poor and disadvantaged, there was no such attempt. In fact, none of the respondents mentioned this objective. To ensure sustainable livelihood of these groups also includes poor women, children, and disabled people. It was gathered that gender was not an explicitly component in the type of project activities undertaken under BAWIN, but the concerns of corruption in the water sector affecting women and girls significantly on many levels were always highlighted in the numerous advocacy campaigns. Special school-related events were organised to highlight the impact of corruption on children. To ensure their inclusion of poor women, children, and the disabled, a long-term programme is needed that must include relevant awareness raising. This will not only give them the tools to raise their voice against corruption, but to gain an understanding of these technical terms (e.g. integrity, accountability, transparency) as well as the responsibilities of the service provider, what are the services the poor should be receiving, and their respective rights and responsibilities. Some of the members of CCCs and YES groups became quite willing to extend their help when needed but a lack of awareness among the wider community regarding their rights prevented them from avail their rights in a productive way thereby helping to achieve the specific objective within the programme time frame.

SPECIFIC STRATEGIC DIRECTION FOR FUTURE PROGRAMMING

Human Resources, Management, and Network Members

Recommendations: BAWIN and KWASA

TI-B has a very efficient technical management person to administer the BAWIN programme, especially during its crisis period and end phase. For BAWIN to continue, it should consider the following issues, keeping that in mind.

- Utilize the technical and managerial support of WIN and TI-B in a systematic way.
- Give the responsibility to the present Project Officer for the interim period, until it is taken over by TI-B, for her relevant education and experience—guided by the Director, Outreach and Communication, owing to his skill and expertise and experience with BAWIN from the beginning.
- Make a list of network members, based on their interests, strengths, and focus areas noted on the membership form.
- Strengthen the capacities of the network members and other stakeholders gradually and then give responsibilities to them according to their strength and willingness.
- Costs can also be shared by network members, according to their interest, for different activities.
- BAWIN should take the responsibility only to monitor and draw technical support from WIN and TI-B as per the present agreement.
- Support should be gradually phased out when network members are confident enough to completely take over responsibility to sustain the work.
- TI-B's media connections should be positively used to make more people aware of the BAWIN activities as well as the success of KWASA.

Training and Capacity Building

Capacity building is the development of skills, knowledge, and the ability to engage with others. The purpose of all the training programmes, therefore, was to increase the skills and knowledge of people working in the public or private agencies. BAWIN has taken steps to build the capacity of the relevant stakeholders, as capacity development was a major thematic area of the programme. All the initiatives for building capacity were well implemented; but for any continuation of the programme the following issues should be considered. Capacity building is an essential component of both empowerment and enabling.

Recommendations: BAWIN

- Emphasize ethics education for all, especially the students as planned, as it relates to integrity issues, so that they are able to change their behaviour and combat corruption.
- Ensure the training of government officers to build the capacity of public employees at their agencies.
- Develop a standard training module to be used by all as and when necessary without the support of BAWIN.
- Provide trainees with a brief pictorial handout or guideline that they can take away to review further as a support for using their new knowledge of water integrity issues.
- Ensure continuous, systematic follow-up of the training so that changed behaviour becomes a practice.

- Communicate with the relevant government department and local NGOs about disseminating water integrity materials in their relevant training curricula or awareness programmes as part of cost sharing. This can be done through the partner organizations of the network members.

Recommendations: KWASA

- Customize and simplify the IM Toolbox to be used by other network members working on this water integrity issues. It should be produced in Bangla as also suggested in one of the KWASA workshops, also taking into account the understanding level and qualification of the employees working at KWASA and other public agencies.
- Poor families and underprivileged communities should be made aware of water integrity issues and their rights so that they know how to respond to service inequity by making their voices heard. This will help to achieve the one of the objectives laid out in the recently ended programme.
- Activities involving young people should be strengthened by giving more responsibility to the YES members and students working as change agents to raise awareness of water integrity issues among members of their communities. Areas and targets can be assigned for each of member or student to facilitate the multiplication of knowledge.
- The monitoring of the IM Toolbox by a coach helped ensure effective implementation of this activity at KWASA. Every employee involved with the IM Toolbox should be given the responsibility of the coach.
- Provide a guideline document to the journalists and YES members—anyone working as change agents—to write reports or work on addressing integrity issues.

Research, Knowledge, Communications, Advocacy, and Publications

The development of a knowledge base on water Integrity was one of the major objectives of the programme. Most of the activities under this component were undertaken in the second and third years of the project and for the most part completed. For its smooth and sustainable future programming, the following strategies are suggested.

Recommendations: BAWIN

- Strengthening the links between local and national advocacy work should continue, ideally in association with a strong advocacy partner and by making best use of the available research and policy information which BAWIN gathered during the end phase of the programme.
- Publish and widely share all the evidence-based findings from the various studies (e.g. Mayur River, ETP).
- Follow up on the journalists' support and prior training to publicize briefs of the findings as well as news on any good examples/outcomes in the local newspaper to encourage other groups.
- Develop a pictorial booklet focusing just on water integrity activities and as well as good examples/outcomes for wider dissemination.
- Develop a newsletter on regular activities to keep relevant stakeholders and network members updated
- Give the responsibility of advocacy-related activities to the network members according to their strengths and capacity on a cost-sharing basis.
- Pursue opportunities to achieve wider publicity on BAWIN's programme on water integrity issues through large markets such as BTV and Radio Bangladesh, which are more widely accessible than private channels. Also consider working with private radio stations (e.g. FM, Radio Foorti) to broadcast awareness discussions around water integrity issues.

Recommendations: KWASA

- Capacity building such as the IM Toolbox approach can have a greater impact if supported by proper advocacy initiatives at the regulatory level.
- Although participants had already taken part in the adaptation workshop, it proved important to repeat the steps in Bangla to deepen their understanding.
- 'Integrity' is still a novel concept/new terminology to many people, so this type of capacity building initiative should be backed up with awareness-raising initiatives.
- The following steps are also recommended to take the KWASA activity further:
 - Publish a story or stories based follow-up news in the local newspaper.
 - To strengthen advocacy, share the good practices of KWASA during a public hearing, showing people that change can happen.
 - Undertake research on other public agencies working in the water sector, such as KDA or City Corporation, for comparative analysis put into context the degree of change at KWASA.
 - The success of KWASA can be used as a strong by publicizing the story widely in the media, as was done with the broadcasting of the video documentary on leading private channels.

Monitoring

Monitoring is the systematic and routine collection of information from projects and programmes for four main purposes⁶:

- To learn from experiences to improve practices and activities in the future
- To have internal and external accountability for the resources used and the result obtained
- To take informed decisions on the future of the initiative
- To promote empowerment of beneficiaries of the initiative

Recommendations: BAWIN and KWASA

Monitoring allows results, processes, and experiences to be documented and used as a basis to steer decision-making and learning. If BAWIN continues, for its credibility it should consider monitoring as an integral part of its project development and implementation. Below are suggestions for strengthening the monitoring component of BAWIN by developing monitoring indicators. An indicator is a measure used to demonstrate change in a situation, or the progress in, or results of, an activity, project, or programme⁷. Indicators are essential instruments for monitoring, and exist in many different forms, which BAWIN can identify/select as per need. These steps are needed for KWASA as well.

- The indicators should be described in band format to see the gradual development of each activity. For example, if a utility is able to provide a WASA line in 30 days this would be represented in band 1; if provided within 20 days, it would be shown in band 2; if within 15 days it would be shown in band 3; and so on. This is a quite effective tool for measuring as well as motivating gradual progress.
- Emphasis should be placed on quality rather than quantity.

⁶ www.sportanddev.org

⁷ www.ceecis.org

- Monitoring visits should be carried out in collaboration with designated WASA employees to encourage ownership and sustainability.
- WIN and TI-B should provide continuous qualitative monitoring support.
- A simple yet effective M&E system can be created for the project which will allow teams to collect key data and assess progress towards outcomes on an annual basis.

CONCLUSION

The two-year BAWIN initiative served as an opportunity to create a base for water integrity issues and a platform for the network to focus on this issue and work together, building on lessons learned and promoting a broader roll-out of the approach in future. On balance, despite the relatively short implementation period, it is clear that the basic issue has achieved a degree of validity in practice and that broader stakeholder engagement in water integrity promotes an improved understanding.

The focus areas of the programme were largely considered to be relevant at all levels and progress was made in most of the areas towards the achievement of programme objectives. Overall, one of the main areas of achievement and encouragement is the realization of a PPPP through the implementation of the IM Toolbox at KWSA using a multi-dimensional approach involving different sectors. Entering a public agency and implementing any new approach within a short time frame is a challenge. Moreover, considering the government's somewhat antagonistic relationship with TI-B around the subject of corruption, the achievement is remarkable. Successful implementation of the IM Toolbox has contributed to increased confidence levels among the government employees at KWSA.

To consolidate gains and promote wider impact and sustainability, more remains to be done in areas of advocacy, primarily by building on initial successes achieved and linking work being undertaken in the implementation areas to the national level through strong partnerships. For future work, it is essential that BAWIN strengthen its approach to M&E, using clear outcome indicators and developing simple tools to collect data and track progress towards objectives on a regular basis.

Although the goals of the project were found to be too ambitious for such a short time frame, through its combination of various awareness-training programmes and activities, BAWIN has created a base to work from going forwards. WIN is willing to provide the technical and financial support and TI-B is willing to assume water integrity into their core programme after 2019. As TI-B's experience in anti-corruption, especially in the challenging environment of Bangladesh, is unquestionable and necessary and WIN's international expertise is also essential, clear roles and responsibilities should be assigned as in the earlier agreement, but with the addition of a qualified person from among the network members or TI-B to ensure implementation until taken over by TI-B.

Emphasis should be placed on creating stability by committing to the programme, for the betterment of water integrity in general and the Government of Bangladesh in particular. Moving forwards, BAWIN should recommit to its strengths while making changes and improvements in the areas discussed. In doing so, it will build a strong, reliable base for water integrity in Bangladesh that can ultimately be locally sustained without external support.

Semi-structured Interviews: List of Network Members Interviewed

SI	Name	Position	Name of Organisation
1.	Dr. K. Azharul haq	President	Bangladesh Water partnership
2.	Dr. Khairul Islam	Country Representative	Water Aid Bangladesh

3.	Mr. S.M.A. Rashid	Executive Director	NGO Forum for Public Health
4.	Alok Majumder	Country Coordinator	Bangladesh WASH Alliance
5.	Mohammed Ziaul Haider, Ph.D.	Professor, Economics Discipline and Additional Director, International Quality Assurance Cell (IQAC)	Khulna University